

spaces, too. These poems are bound together by blood, which is hard to miss as an overwhelming number of the poems pulse with this most sacred element. But another power is present, too, and perhaps it is the most important of all. The last line of this book reveals this best: “Hope. Here is hope” (99). Hope, it seems, is the thing that remains.

Shawn Bowers
Queens University of Charlotte

Erin Lane

MacManus, Viviana Beatriz. *Disruptive Archives: Feminist Memories of Resistance in Latin America's Dirty Wars*. U of Illinois P, 2020. 218 pp.

Dirty Wars are synonymous with Southern Cone Cold War dictatorships, chiefly that of Argentina. In *Disruptive Archives*, MacManus provides us with a look into the Dirty Wars in both Argentina and Mexico during the 20th century, expanding the archival knowledge of Dirty Wars in Latin America. As the title implies, MacManus not only looks to uncover the stories of women in conflicts beyond Argentina, but also to create an epistemological shift which values the testimonies of women as activists with the same agency as their male counterparts and presents them not as sexualized and infantilized subjects. These “disruptive archives” include oral histories and testimonies of women who experienced disappearances, incarceration, and torture during their respective state sponsored Dirty Wars, and a revised analysis of texts and films from the female lens that oppose a traditional hetero-patriarchal discourse. She posits that these archives have the potential to “recuperate the historical memories of those affected by state violence” (161), and in turn, will provide a more thorough and transnational understanding of the atrocities committed during the Dirty Wars.

In the introduction entitled, “All of Latin America Is Sown with the Bones of [Its] Forgotten Youth”: Hemispheric State Terror and Latin American Feminist Theories of Justice”, MacManus gives background information on Dirty Wars in Latin America, situating Mexico within the group of Dirty War countries. She also outlines her methodology in conducting interviews with survivors where the gestures and pauses of the women interviewed serve as an extra layer of understanding their narratives. Here MacManus also presents the feminist theoretical framework of her research.

The first chapter, “Critical Latin American Feminist Perspectives and the Limits and Possibilities of Human Rights Reports”, discusses the CONADEP report *Nunca más* generated after the Dirty War in Argentina and the FEMOSPP report on the atrocities of Mexico's Dirty War. The author traces a chronology from the Dirty Wars to the present and demonstrates the importance of human rights and women's rights movements in the discourse of the CONADEP and FEMOSPP reports. She explains the impetus for the commissions and their resulting reports as fueled by transitional governmental desires to distance themselves from their predecessors with a goal of furthering their neoliberal ideals. It is here where MacManus

presents the problematic of the representation of women prisoners in the reports and how it aligns with a gendered view of women. MacManus also uses this chapter to present texts that oppose the discourse of the CONADEP and FEMOSPP reports. *Ni el flaco perdón de Dios* (Gelman 1997) serves as a counterpoint to *Nunca más* that edited the testimonies of women for seeming too subversive. Its testimonies of women are unedited, thus affording them agency and allowing them to identify as activists. *A Single Numberless Death* (Stejilevich 2002) is an experimental text whose diachronic account of the Argentine Dirty War describes rape in a way in which the women have agency and are not merely poor vulnerable females. The chapter concludes with a look at Elena Poniatowska's *La noche de Tlatelolco* which MacManus says, "offers us a glimpse of the critical gendered history of Mexico's Dirty War", one that is, "decidedly absent from the state-sponsored reports like those from FEMOSPP and CONADEP." (59)

"Sexual Necropolitics, Survival, and the Gender of Betrayal" is the second chapter of the book and includes analysis of the film *Garage Olimpo* (Bechi 1991) and the novella *El apando* (Revueltas 1969) to mirror the carceral space in the Dirty Wars and demonstrate how sexual necropolitics played an important role in controlling the populous during the conflicts. *Garage Olimpo* presents the fetishization of the tortured female body and the legacy of La Malinche represented by female captives who have sex with their captors to survive. Similarly, the women in *El apando* also serve as examples of the Malinche trope and the carceral space represents the womb/death. MacManus presents Liliana Heber's 1996 novel, *El fin de la historia*, and Hernán Valdes' *Tejas verdes* (1974) to demonstrate how women prisoners were viewed in and out of the carceral space. She uses the phrase, "los hijos de la chingada" from Octavio Paz's poem "Los hijos de la Malinche" in *El laberinto de la soledad* (1950) demonstrating that society views the female prisoners who engaged in sex with their captors to survive as equal betrayers of Malinche, while also explaining that those women who were strong and rejected their sexual advances were ultimately killed or were released and rejected by their families, as is seen in Andres di Tella's documentary, *Montaneros* (1996). This assertion brilliantly demonstrates the gendered expectations of women in both the leftist organizations and authoritarian regimes of the Dirty Wars.

MacManus' disruptive archives are found in the third and fourth chapters of the book: "Ghosts of Another Era": Gendered Haunting and the Legacy of Women's Armed Conflict" and "Gendered Memories, Collective Subjectivity, and Solidarity Practices in Women's Oral Histories". Here MacManus explains the reluctance of survivor testimony and its potential threat to human life, making it essential for effecting change. The rich testimonies in these two chapters explain the occurrence of unvoiced gestures and pauses in testimonies and how recording them helps to piece together their complete stories. The reader also learns of the dynamics within the leftist organizations and how they affected guerrilleras' actions during and after incarceration and their reluctance to testify.

The Epilogue, "The Legacy of State-Sanctioned Violence and Specters of the Dirty War's Radical Women", ties the previous chapters together so the reader can situate previous archival work alongside these disruptive archives. MacManus' text provides feminist scholars

and historians with an important framework for recording the testimonies of women in political conflicts. The text provides a thorough historical and cultural background necessary to understand both the conflicts, their previous archives, and the fundamental need to fill in the gaps. For Latin American scholars, it is a crucial text in understanding the conflict.

Erin Lane
Arizona State University

Rebecca M. Bender

Soria, Mar. *Geographies of Urban Female Labor and Nationhood in Spanish Culture, 1880-1975*. U of Nebraska P, 2020. 334 pp.

Mar Soria's *Geographies of Urban Female Labor and Nationhood in Spanish Culture (1880-1975)* offers an innovative examination of how working women in nineteenth- and twentieth-century Spain experienced and interpreted urban spaces. This is the first academic monograph to examine female labor primarily within the realm of Spanish cultural production, including literary, cinematic, and performative texts. While previous studies on Spanish women's entrance and increasing presence in the public labor economy have been grounded in historiography or sociology, Soria's *Geographies* privileges representations of female labor in cultural artifacts, which are valued as sites through which power is negotiated (11). The diversity of literary and cultural texts analyzed—from 19th-century *zarzuelas* and realist narratives to 20th-century avant-garde novels, journalism, and film—is one of this book's greatest strengths. This focus on women's representation within the "symbolic realm of discourse" offers a fresh examination of working women's experiences in urban spaces and their potential to both "contest and reinforce hegemonic discourses of class, gender, and space" (10). In opposition to the dominant discourse celebrating the wholly domestic, middle-class ideal of the *ángel del hogar*, the urban working woman was undomesticated, public, and viewed suspiciously as (sexually) uncontrollable and hazardous to both Spanish womanhood and national identity (3-4). According to Soria, this urban working woman—a marginal Other or "deviant from the conventional ideal of femininity"—was either excluded from nation-building projects or, somewhat paradoxically, incorporated into them by way of a deliberate (re)fashioning of their identity as traditionally or authentically Spanish in the face of a threatening modernity (10).

Soria's Introduction, "Dismantling the Myth of Female Domesticity," describes her goal as constructing a "feminist geography of urban female labor" (rather than a cartography of geographical city spaces) (9). To achieve this, *Geographies* focuses on gender and class within concrete and abstract spaces—the body, the home, the workspace, the city, the nation—where "meaning and power are constituted" (10). The book's six chapters explore these sites chronologically through literary and aesthetic tendencies. Beginning in the late nineteenth century, Chapter 1, "The Castiza Working Woman: *Regeneracionismo* in Género Chico," analyzes portrayals of female cigar factory workers, flower vendors, and *cupletistas*, or risqué song performers in three *zarzuelas*: *Las cigarerras* (1887), by Ángel Munilla and Luis Ferreiro;